

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments • XIII

Online Materials • XV

PART ONE: INTRODUCTION • 1

Chapter 1: Reasoning and Critical Thinking • 3

1.1 Reasoning • 3

1.2 The Concept of Logical Strength • 5

1.3 Truth, Logical Strength, and Soundness • 7

1.4 Critical Thinking Skills • 9

1.5 Critical Thinking and the Science of Logic • 11

1.6 Self-Test No. 1 • 12

1.7 Questions for Discussion • 14

PART TWO: MEANING • 17

Chapter 2: Meaning and Definition • 19

2.1 The Complexity of Language • 19

2.2 The Meaning of Language • 21

2.2.1 The Reference Theory of Meaning • 21

2.2.2 The Idea Theory of Meaning • 22

2.2.3 Meaning as Use • 22

2.3 The Main Functions of Language • 24

2.4 Self-Test No. 2 • 29

2.5 Questions for Discussion • 30

2.6 Definition • 31

2.7 The Purposes of Definition • 32

2.7.1 Reportive Definitions • 32

2.7.2 Stipulative Definitions • 33

2.7.3 Essentialist Definitions • 33

2.8 Methods of Definition • 34

2.8.1 Genus-Species Method • 34

2.8.2 Ostensive Method • 35

2.8.3 Synonym Method • 35

2.8.4 Operational Method • 36

2.8.5 Contextual Method • 36

- 2.9 Assessing Reportive Definitions • 36
 - 2.9.1 Too Broad a Definition • 37
 - 2.9.2 Too Narrow a Definition • 37
 - 2.9.3 Too Broad and Too Narrow a Definition • 38
 - 2.9.4 Circular Definition • 38
 - 2.9.5 Obscure Definition • 39
- 2.10 Assessing Stipulative and Essentialist Definitions • 39
- 2.11 A Warning • 42
- 2.12 Self-Test No. 3 • 43
- 2.13 Questions for Discussion • 43

Chapter 3: Clarifying Meaning • 47

- 3.1 The Principle of Charity • 47
- 3.2 Linguistic Ambiguity • 49
 - 3.2.1 Ambiguity and Vagueness • 49
 - 3.2.2 Referential Ambiguity • 51
 - 3.2.3 Grammatical Ambiguity • 52
 - 3.2.4 Use and Mention • 52
- 3.3 Self-Test No. 4 • 53
- 3.4 Analytic, Contradictory, and Synthetic Statements • 54
- 3.5 Self-Test No. 5 • 56
- 3.6 Descriptive and Evaluative Meaning • 57
- 3.7 Self-Test No. 6 • 58
- 3.8 Necessary and Sufficient Conditions • 59
- 3.9 Self-Test No. 7 • 63
- 3.10 Questions for Discussion • 64

Chapter 4: Reconstructing Arguments • 67

- 4.1 Reconstruction • 67
- 4.2 Missing Premises and Conclusions • 68
- 4.3 Self-Test No. 8 • 72
- 4.4 Special Cases • 72
 - 4.4.1 Reports of Arguments • 73
 - 4.4.2 Explanations • 74
- 4.5 Self-Test No. 9 • 77
- 4.6 The Structure of Arguments • 78
 - 4.6.1 Simple Arguments • 78
 - 4.6.2 T Arguments • 79

- 4.6.3 V Arguments • 80
- 4.6.4 Complex Arguments • 81
- 4.7 Self-Test No. 10 • 84
- 4.8 Another Warning • 85
- 4.9 Questions for Discussion • 86

PART THREE: ASSESSING ARGUMENTS • 89

Chapter 5: Strategies for Assessing Arguments • 91

- 5.1 The Fallacies Approach • 91
- 5.2 The Criterial Approach • 92
 - 5.2.1 The Three Criteria of a Sound Argument • 93
- 5.3 Seven Rules for Assessing Arguments • 95
 - 5.3.1 Rule 1: Identify the Main Conclusion • 95
 - 5.3.2 Rule 2: Identify the Premises • 95
 - 5.3.3 Rule 3: Identify the Structure of the Argument • 96
 - 5.3.4 Rule 4: Check the Acceptability of the Premises • 96
 - 5.3.5 Rule 5: Check the Relevance of the Premises • 96
 - 5.3.6 Rule 6: Check the Adequacy of the Premises • 96
 - 5.3.7 Rule 7: Look for Counter-Arguments • 96

Chapter 6: Assessing Truth-Claims • 99

- 6.1 Theories of Truth • 99
 - 6.1.1 The Correspondence Theory • 99
 - 6.1.2 The Coherence Theory • 100
 - 6.1.3 The Pragmatic Theory • 102
- 6.2 Types of Truth-Claims • 104
 - 6.2.1 Empirical Truth-Claims • 104
 - 6.2.2 Non-Empirical Truth-Claims • 107
- 6.3 Acceptability • 109
- 6.4 Self-Test No. 11 • 113
- 6.5 Questions for Discussion • 113
- 6.6 Assessing the Acceptability of Premises • 114
- 6.7 Some Particular Fallacies • 115
 - 6.7.1 Begging the Question • 115
 - 6.7.2 Inconsistency • 117
 - 6.7.3 Equivocation • 120
 - 6.7.4 False Dichotomy • 121

- 6.8 Self-Test No. 12 • 123
- 6.9 Questions for Discussion • 124

Chapter 7: Assessing Relevance • 127

- 7.1 The Criterion of Relevance • 127
- 7.2 Recognizing Irrelevant Premises • 128
- 7.3 Appeals to Authority (1) • 131
- 7.4 Some Particular Fallacies • 133
 - 7.4.1 Ad Hominem • 133
 - 7.4.2 Tu Quoque • 135
 - 7.4.3 Straw Man • 136
- 7.5 Self-Test No. 13 • 137
- 7.6 Questions for Discussion • 139

Chapter 8: Assessing Adequacy • 141

- 8.1 The Criterion of Adequacy • 141
- 8.2 Appeals to Authority (2) • 144
- 8.3 Appeals to Anecdotal Evidence • 146
- 8.4 Appeals to Ignorance • 148
- 8.5 The Slippery Slope Fallacy • 149
- 8.6 Causal Fallacies • 153
 - 8.6.1 Post Hoc • 153
 - 8.6.2 Confusing Cause and Effect • 154
 - 8.6.3 Common Cause • 155
- 8.7 Self-Test No. 14 • 156
- 8.8 Questions for Discussion • 158

Chapter 9: Deductive Reasoning • 161

- 9.1 The Nature of Deductive Reasoning • 161
- 9.2 Truth-Functional Statements • 163
- 9.3 Formal Validity and Soundness • 168
- 9.4 Valid Argument Forms • 169
- 9.5 Formal Invalidity • 173
- 9.6 Self-Test No. 15 • 175
- 9.7 Questions for Discussion • 176

Chapter 10: Inductive Reasoning • 179

- 10.1 The Nature of Inductive Reasoning • 179
- 10.2 Inductive Generalization • 181

- 10.3 Statistical Syllogism • 182
- 10.4 Induction by Confirmation • 183
- 10.5 Analogical Reasoning • 188
- 10.6 Self-Test No. 16 • 194
- 10.7 Questions for Discussion • 196

PART FOUR: APPLICATIONS • 199

Chapter 11: Scientific Reasoning • 201

- 11.1 Causation / Correlation • 201
- 11.2 Mill's Methods • 205
 - 11.2.1 Method of Agreement • 205
 - 11.2.2 Method of Difference • 208
 - 11.2.3 Joint Method of Agreement and Difference • 210
 - 11.2.4 Method of Concomitant Variations • 214
 - 11.2.5 Method of Residue • 215
- 11.3 Self-Test No. 17 • 217
- 11.4 Inference to the Best Explanation • 219
 - 11.4.1 Choosing between Rival Restricted Hypotheses • 221
 - 11.4.2 Choosing between Rival Unrestricted Hypotheses • 224
- 11.5 Case for Discussion: Semmelweis's Discovery of Antisepsis • 228

Chapter 12: Moral Reasoning • 233

- 12.1 Moral Judgments and Judgments of Taste • 233
- 12.2 Moral Justification • 235
- 12.3 Appeals to Principles of Right and Wrong • 237
- 12.4 Self-Test No. 18 • 241
- 12.5 Questions for Discussion • 241
- 12.6 Appeals to Consequences • 242
- 12.7 Self-Test No. 19 • 246
- 12.8 Questions for Discussion • 246
- 12.9 Rational Agreement • 246
- 12.10 Moral Maturity • 247
- 12.11 Questions for Discussion • 250

Chapter 13: Legal Reasoning • 253

- 13.1 Criteria and Evidence in Legal Contests • 253
 - 13.1.1 Evidence of Facts, and the Interpretation of Law • 255
 - 13.1.2 Admissible Evidence and the Application of Law • 259
 - 13.1.3 Legal Authority and Legal Procedure • 260

- 13.2 Criminal Adjudication • 262
- 13.3 Self-Test No. 20 • 268
- 13.4 Questions for Discussion • 269
- 13.5 Civil Adjudication • 269
- 13.6 Self-Test No. 21 • 275
- 13.7 Questions for Discussion • 278

Chapter 14: Arguing Back • 281

- 14.1 Explaining the Weakness • 281
- 14.2 Counter-Examples • 282
- 14.3 Absurd Examples • 284
- 14.4 Counter-Arguments • 286
- 14.5 Self-Test No. 22 • 288
- 14.6 Questions for Discussion • 289

Chapter 15: Irrational Techniques of Persuasion • 291

- 15.1 Loaded Terms • 291
- 15.2 Vague Terms • 293
- 15.3 Loaded Questions • 293
- 15.4 False Confidence • 297
- 15.5 Selectivity • 298
- 15.6 Misleading Statistics • 299
- 15.7 Humor • 301
- 15.8 Red Herring • 302
- 15.9 Guilt by Association • 303
- 15.10 Persuasive Redefinition • 304
- 15.11 Self-Test No. 23 • 305
- 15.12 Questions for Discussion • 307

Chapter 16: Critiquing the Media • 309

- 16.1 Determining Bias • 310
- 16.2 Is Objective Reporting Possible? • 312
- 16.3 How to Assess News Reports • 316
 - 16.3.1 Assessing Factual Claims • 317
 - 16.3.2 Assessing Interpretive Frameworks • 318
- 16.4 Another Warning • 319
- 16.5 Questions for Discussion • 321

Chapter 17: Writing and Assessing Argumentative Essays • 343

- 17.1 Writing Argumentative Essays: Structure • 344
- 17.2 Writing Argumentative Essays: Style • 346
- 17.3 Assessing Argumentative Essays • 348
 - 17.3.1 First Phase • 348
 - 17.3.2 Second Phase • 349
 - 17.3.3 Third Phase • 350
- 17.4 Assessment of a Sample Argumentative Essay • 350
 - 17.4.1 First Phase • 352
 - 17.4.2 Second Phase • 354
 - 17.4.3 Third Phase • 358
- 17.5 Question for Discussion • 361

Chapter 18: Strategies for Organizing an Argumentative Essay • 365

- 18.1 Advocate's Strategy • 368
- 18.2 Skeptic's Strategy • 373
- 18.3 Impartial Adjudicator's Strategy • 379
- 18.4 Questions for Discussion • 383

Appendix I: Paradoxes and Puzzles • 385

- 1. Logical Paradoxes • 385
- 2. Puzzles • 390
- 3. Solutions to the Puzzles • 393

Appendix II: Answers to Self-Tests • 397

- Self-Test No. 1 • 397
- Self-Test No. 2 • 400
- Self-Test No. 3 • 400
- Self-Test No. 4 • 401
- Self-Test No. 5 • 403
- Self-Test No. 6 • 404
- Self-Test No. 7 • 405
- Self-Test No. 8 • 407
- Self-Test No. 9 • 408
- Self-Test No. 10 • 409
- Self-Test No. 11 • 412
- Self-Test No. 12 • 413
- Self-Test No. 13 • 415

Self-Test No. 14	•	417
Self-Test No. 15	•	419
Self-Test No. 16	•	422
Self-Test No. 17	•	428
Self-Test No. 18	•	433
Self-Test No. 19	•	433
Self-Test No. 20	•	437
Self-Test No. 21	•	438
Self-Test No. 22	•	439
Self-Test No. 23	•	440

Glossary	•	443
----------	---	-----

Permission Acknowledgments	•	461
----------------------------	---	-----

Index	•	463
-------	---	-----